

**A SUMMARY OF THE MINUTES OF THE
GLEN RIDGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
HELD IN THE MUNICIPAL BUILDING**

December 5, 2018

OPMA & Roll Call

Chair Herrigel called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. and Ms. Hickey read the Sunshine Act Notice and called the roll.

PRESENT: Chair Herrigel
Vice Chair Githens
Darby
Vande Stouwe
Way¹
Grisafi (Alt. 2)
Moriarty (Alt. 1)

Margaret Hickey, Consultant to the Historic Preservation Commission

ABSENT: McMahon
Switzer

Introduction

Chair Herrigel introduced himself and briefly described the hearing process to the members of the public.

Hearing of the Applications

Lynne Vande Stouwe recused herself from the first application.

38 Clinton Road

Fang Shi Sun & Yixiang Huang

Chair Herrigel called for the application. The Owners, Fang Shi Sun & Yixiang Huang, presented the application, which is a continuation from the November 7, 2018 meeting. The two remaining items for discussion were the widening of an existing window on the driveway side at the kitchen elevation and the change from aluminum to vinyl siding without prior HPC approval.

The Owners explained that the contractor was to attend the meeting but their primary contact is sick. The contractor stated that the reason they did not advise the Owner that the HPC had purview because they surveyed the block and found most of the siding was not wood and the building already was clad with aluminum, and due to the change in the permit rules with regarding recladding. The HPC debated the statement that many of the neighbors' houses were clad with either aluminum or vinyl. The HPC also questioned the timing about the permit rules since the Borough changed the ordinance to require review of siding changes even though permits are not required much earlier in the year. The Chair expressed the concern that the contractor may not have given an accurate representation of the situation to the Owner and again asked for the contractor to explain themselves to the HPC. The HPC further discussed

¹ C.E. John Way arrived a little late but did not miss application presentations.

the difference between the aluminum and the vinyl with Way noting that the weathered dimension would be important in his decision-making on the matter; the weathered dimension on the siding would be less than the aluminum (4 – 5 inches).

The Owners presented new drawings showing the proposed window, which includes widening the opening and installing two casement sashes. The Owner explained the process and the costs associated with the changes, which led to a lengthy discussion. The HPC in general did not approve of the change and made a recommendation for the Owner to use the existing window opening and install two smaller casement sashes with a dividing mullion similar to the windows at the attic level and explained the reasoning behind the recommendation. Owner noted they would return with a revised window design.

On a motion by Chair Herrigel, seconded by Mr. Way, the application was moved as follows:

1. To approve the installation of the vinyl siding;
2. Applicant to return with respect to the window based on HPC feedback including providing an exterior elevation of driveway façade only.

Darby	Yes	Githens	No	Herrigel	Yes
McMahon	Absent	Way	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Recused
Switzer	Absent	Moriarty (Alt. 1)	Yes	Grisafi (Alt. 2)	No

Lynne Vande Stouwe returned to the meeting.

Sarah Githens recused herself from the next application.

57 Benson Street

Nora Hummel and Jack Leigh

Chair Herrigel called for the application. Nora Hummel and Jack Leigh, Owners, and Val C. DiGiacinto, R.A., presented the application, which is to construct a new one-story addition to the rear along with minor modifications of the fenestration at the existing building. The architect noted the design includes matching all of the details of the existing house. Darby noted the design is respectful to the original house.

On a motion by Mr. Darby, seconded by Ms. Vande Stouwe, the application was approved as submitted.

Darby	Yes	Githens	Recused	Herrigel	Yes
McMahon	Absent	Way	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Switzer	Absent	Moriarty (Alt. 1)	Yes	Grisafi (Alt. 2)	Yes

Sarah Githens returned to the meeting.

233 Forest Avenue

Bradley and Kendell Timmers

Chair Herrigel called for the application. Bradley Timmers, Owner, presented the application with the Architect, Courtney Rombough, AIA, to rebuild the existing garage to match in-kind with the exception of the garage doors which are proposed to change from two doors to one and the roof, which is currently slate, to asphalt shingle with an option of simulated slate. The owner noted they would prefer to use asphalt shingles.

Githens noted the concern of changing from two openings to one but understands the reasoning. Also, there is concern about the fake graining on the steel doors proposed. Herrigel noted the graining may not be visible from the street given how far back the garage is on the lot. Grisafi recommended changing the door to one that looks like two doors but is really one door and noted a smooth Fiberglas (or equal) does a better job of looking like wood than steel. Grisafi also discussed the simulated slate option; members noted the roof is not visible from the street but understand since it is new construction have purview over the entire design. HPC discussed the changing of the roof from slate to another material and the potential for it to set a bad precedent; HPCs position has evolved for ancillary buildings and the individual characteristics and positioning from the street of those ancillary buildings.

On a motion by Mr. Darby, seconded by Ms. Vande Stouwe, the application was approved with the following conditions to be reviewed by subcommittee.

1. The owner has the option of using either asphalt shingles or simulated slate on the roof with the understanding that the roof is not visible from the street.
2. Provide a cut sheet for the garage door proposed based on the HPCs comments.

Darby	Yes	Githens	Yes	Herrigel	Yes
McMahon	Absent	Way	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Switzer	Absent	Moriarty (Alt. 1)	Yes	Grisafi (Alt. 2)	Yes

60 Lincoln Street

Mark and Jaqueline Weinstein

Chair Herrigel called for the application. Mark Weinstein, Owner, and George Azrak, R.A., Architect, presented the application, which extends the kitchen and family room to the rear and side. Mr. Azrak explained the design, where and how the materials are to be placed and some of the design issues against the existing conditions. Mr. Darby noted that the roof on the Douglas Avenue side is messy. Overall HPC found the massing, siding materials and windows to be generally fine. There was extensive discussion on the treatment of the roof from the front and Douglas. The main issue is the roof had to maintain a lower slope otherwise it would impact a distinctive stained glass window on the rear elevation. The conclusion after discussion with the Architect was to add a cornice detail to match that at the dormers.

On a motion by Ms. Githens, seconded by Mr. Grisafi, the application was approved with the following conditions to be reviewed by subcommittee:

1. Add trim to match existing dormers to the Douglas side of addition at the roof line.
2. The drawings should be updated to note the siding.
3. The drawings should be noted that the brick at chimney is to match existing.

Darby	No	Githens	Yes	Herrigel	Yes
McMahon	Absent	Way	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Switzer	Absent	Moriarty (Alt. 1)	Yes	Grisafi (Alt. 2)	Yes

21 Hillcrest Road

Timothy Daniels

Chair Herrigel called for the application. Simon Stigsby, R.A., Architect, presented the application on behalf of the Owner. The work is to infill one corner of the house in order to extend the kitchen. The design includes removing one window and spanning a triple window matching the main house and spanning the existing and new addition. There was brief

discussion about the windows and that the addition, which is very small, is seamless with the existing house.

On a motion by Mr. Way, seconded by Mr. Grisafi, the application was approved as submitted.

Darby	Yes	Githens	Yes	Herrigel	Yes
McMahon	Absent	Way	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Switzer	Absent	Moriarty (Alt. 1)	Yes	Grisafi (Alt. 2)	Yes

Adoption of the November 7, 2018 Minutes

On a motion by Ms. Githens, seconded by Ms. Vande Stouwe, and approved by the board with the exception of Darby and Way who abstained, the minutes of the November 7, 2018 meeting with noted revisions were adopted.

Subcommittee Reports

182 Ridgewood Avenue: Architect and Owner provided drawings showing removal of the mud room. Since it was a minor change to the approved drawings, subcommittee reviewed and approved.

1 Roswell Terrace: Owner provided revised drawings for subcommittee review.

10 Ardsley Road: Owner requested a change to the existing board siding with Hardie Board; the work is currently under subcommittee rule.

23 Douglas Road: Architect revised the drawings per the recommendations of the HPC and subcommittee reviewed and approved.

HPC Consultant is tracking the following properties that were approved with changes for subcommittee but no action has been taken on the part of the applicant:
442 Ridgewood Avenue and 16 Oakwood.

Old Business

None.

New Business

None.

Adjournment

On a motion by Mr. Darby, seconded by Ms. Githens, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Margaret M. Hickey, AIA
Consultant to Glen Ridge HPC