

**A SUMMARY OF THE MINUTES OF THE
GLEN RIDGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
HELD IN THE MUNICIPAL BUILDING**

January 5, 2022

OPMA & Roll Call

Vice Chair Vande Stouwe called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. and Ms. Hickey read the Sunshine Act Notice and called the roll.

This meeting was held via a video conference.

PRESENT: Vice Chair Vande Stouwe
Darby (Chair)
Colello
Lane
McMahon
Moriarty
Stearns
Yewaisis
Margaret M. Hickey, Consultant to the Historic Preservation Commission

ABSENT:

Introduction

Vice Chair Vande Stouwe introduced herself and briefly described that the Commission has some New Year business to address before hearing the applications.

Election of Chair

On a Motion by Mr. McMahon, seconded by Ms. Vande Stouwe, Mr. Darby was elected Chair of the Commission.

Election of Vice Chair

On a motion by Mr. Darby, seconded by Ms. Yewaisis, Ms. Vande Stouwe was elected Vice Chair of the Commission.

Appointment of Secretary

On a motion by Mr. Darby, seconded by Mr. McMahon, Margaret Hickey was appointed Secretary.

Adoption of By-Laws

Chair Darby questioned changing the language of Item 4 of the By-Laws to include via video conference, but Ms. Hickey clarified the Borough would prefer to leave the language as is

because the meetings via video conference are permitted under Executive Order by the Governor.

On a motion by Mr. McMahon, seconded by Mr. Colello, the By-Laws were unanimously adopted without change.

Adoption of 2021 Schedule of Regular Meetings

On a motion by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, seconded by Ms. Yewaisis, the 2022 Schedule of Meetings was unanimously adopted.

Hearing of the Applications

Chair Darby briefly described the hearing process to the members of the public.

61 Willow Street

Ad Properties

Chair Darby called for the application. Michael Ponce, Owner, and John Monchak, Architect, presented the application as a resubmission from the December meeting to add to and renovate the house on all four sides. The Architect reviewed in detailed the changes made to the design in comparison to the previous submission noting such changes that reflected the HPC members' comments including: lowering of the ridge line approximately 1'-9"; setting back the second floor dormer but stretching it to cover more of the front façade; modifying the front dormer's relationship to the ridge; adjusting the fenestration on all three elevations; adding a window at the attic of each gable; and removing shutters at the first floor windows at the front. To gain more useable space at the attic, a dormer was also added at the rear. Mr. McMahon noted that the applicant listened to the HPCs concerns, found that the building was still a bit too top heavy but understood that this is due the existing width of the building. There was a discussion about the use of mitered joints when using Hardie siding and noted the applicant needs to use the smooth side and to add an aluminum corner piece to obtain the proper appearance for a mitered corner. Mr. Stearns noted that the windows on the northeast elevation are at two different heights/sizes, which reflect the kitchen and half bath on the first floor. Mr. McMahon agreed this should be changed so that both windows are the same size. Mr. Stearns also noted the plans and elevations do not appear to align.

On a motion by Mr. McMahon, seconded by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, the application was approved with the following conditions to be review by the HPC Consultant, except where noted:

1. The Hardie siding shall be installed with mitered corners using aluminum corner pieces. If the Owner changes to corner boards, this must be reviewed by subcommittee.
2. The drawings shall be updated so the plans and elevations align.
3. The window of the kitchen and half bath should be the same size and at the same head height.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)		(Alt. 2)	

Lynn Vande Stouwe recused herself from the next application.

215 Forest Avenue

Jenna and Matt Francke

Chair Darby called for the application. Jenna and Matt Francke, Owners, and Dan Kopec, Architect, presented the application to construct a one-story addition at the rear which will be visible from the north side elevation. The design intent to build where there is currently a screened-in porch and extend from that porch as well as add a wood deck, which will have a wood railing with 2 x 2 balusters at 4 inches on center. Mr. Colello asked if there could be a reveal or joint or have the addition step where the new and old transition. Mr. Kopec said doing either would be a challenge because the rear of the building is chopped up and he felt that gable roof would be a strong indication this work was part of an addition. There are some minor drawing errors on the rear elevation that needed to be cleaned up: remove the vertical line between the two windows on A200 and add the center divider at the framed lattice on the same sheet.

On a motion by Mr. McMahon, seconded by Mr. Colello, the application was approved as submitted.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Recuse
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes	(Alt. 2)	

Lynn Vande Stouwe returned to the meeting.

34 Edgewood Road

Erica Spayd

Chair Darby called for the application. Erica Spayd, Owner, presented the application to remove vinyl siding at the upper levels under the gambrel, paint the shakes at the existing enclosed porch, and to remove the fake brick cladding on the front and side elevations. Ms. Spayd noted that there are water infiltration issues from the brick. The proposed work is to install a two-color smooth surface Hardie siding with a 7-inch exposure. The new window trim shall be 3-1/2 inches or match existing trim where present under the later finishes. The Owner prefers the mitered corner and will go in that direction; if it becomes problematic will return to the HPC for approval of corner boards. Mr. Colello noted that the gable siding might currently be wider than 7 inches. He also asked about the plan for the front brick steps; Ms. Spayd noted they will be painted in a color sympathetic to the siding. Mr. McMahon asked for clarification that the soffits will also be replaced with the Hardie material. There is a trim piece between the second and third floor levels that should also be restored/maintained. This trim piece is visible at the other houses on the block and may be present under the siding/fake brick. Mr. Stearns noted that the treatment of the bay window is unresolved in the rendering and the wood band under the bay window roof should align with the siding transition band at the façade. The skirt board, which is present at the enclosed porch, should be continuous on all elevations. Mr. Stearns also asked what is going to occur with the concrete sills and suspected they will need to be removed once the brick is removed. If so, an historical wood sill will have to be installed.

On a motion by Mr. Stearns, seconded by Mr. Colello, the application was approved as with the following conditions to be reviewed by subcommittee:

1. Maintain the separation between the second and third floor levels by adding a trim board/repairing any trim board under the siding/fake brick.
2. If the concrete sills are removed, they should be replaced with historic wood sills. Applicant shall provide a detail to HPC prior to replacement.
3. Drawings shall be revised to reflect the existing detailing of the bay window on the side elevation.
4. The mitered corner detail shall be maintained; any change shall be reviewed by subcommittee.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)		(Alt. 2)	

Dan McMahon recused himself from the next application.

138 Sherman Avenue

Wendy Castro

Chair Darby called for the application. Wendy Castro, Owner, and Val DiGiacinto, Architect, presented the application to add a new stair and deck at the rear of the existing two-family home. The only portion of the construction visible from the street will be a few feet of the lower section of the stair. The railing is designed to match the porch at the front. Mr. Colello noted that there is a window missing on the drawing at the second-floor rear elevation.

On a motion by Mr. Colello, seconded by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, the application was approved as submitted.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Recuse
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes	(Alt. 2)	

Mr. McMahon returned to the meeting.

10 Wildwood Terrace

Leigh Ann and Matt Tuleson

Chair Darby called for the application. Leigh Ann and Matt Tuleson, Owners, and Dan Kopec, Architect, presented the application to remove a one-story rear addition, expand it and add a second floor and side entrance porch. The new windows will be custom wood to match the main house. The addition will carry the detailing of the main house including the columns and railings of the front porch. There will be siding at the first floor and shingles at the upper floors. The roof over the addition is designed to be shallow in order to clear a dormer on the main house. Mr. McMahon thought the addition was nicely done but questioned whether there should be a column on the porch next to the house and if it should be an engaged pilaster

instead. Mr. Stearns agreed that the full column is too heavy. Mr. Stearns also asked about the relationship of the addition in depth to that of the next-door neighbor's house; Mr. Kopec said the addition will need a variance but it is only slightly deeper than the adjacent house. Mr. Stearns and Ms. Yewaisis both noted that a window at the rear might be a nice addition. The Owner showed a photograph of the front porch; there is no pilaster or column at the transition of porch to the main building so one would not be installed at the proposed rear porch.

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Mr. McMahon, the application was approved with the following condition to be reviewed by the HPC Consultant:

1. Remove the column/pilaster where the porch meets the house to match the front porch.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)		(Alt. 2)	

43 Willow Street

Jason Awad

Chair Darby called for the application. Jason Awad, Owner, and Michael Tejada, design/realtor, presented the application to garner approval from the HPC for as-built conditions. The Owners installed new vertical board and batten vinyl siding on the front and horizontal vinyl siding on the side elevations replacing older vinyl siding without approval. In addition, the retaining walls, the foundation, and the chimney were clad with a modern stone facing material. The railings at the front stairs were replaced and are not in keeping with the design guidelines. All of this work was installed without prior HPC review or approval. There were lengthy discussions about each of the building components between the Owner, his representative, and the HPC members. The HPC started the discussions on the use of stone which replaced a thin brick at the foundation; it was agreed that a thin brick would be a more appropriate cladding material and the stone should be removed at the foundation and chimney. There were some questions about the height of the retaining wall and whether it was under the HPCs jurisdiction but that it should also match that of the foundation with a brick veneer. The brick should match the color, texture, brick size and mortar color of that of the existing stairs to the front door.

The HPC members explained that vinyl is not a historically appropriate material and that although vinyl and aluminum can be found on many houses along Willow Street, these were installed before the street was included in the Historic District. Mr. Stearns led the conversations about the treatment of the siding and railings. The use of vertical siding at the front of the house, in particular, is out of context for the building and street. Changing vinyl to vinyl, no matter the configuration, is also problematic as other applicants have made a similar request and been denied and do not follow the design guidelines. Mr. Stearns proposed as a compromise for the Owner to change the cladding at the front elevation but possibly leave the side elevations as vinyl. Although the HPC members were sympathetic to the Owner, they did not appear to agree with this approach, and were concerned that this approach may set a bad precedent. There was further discussion on this matter including that if this approach was taken, it would have to be clear that this is not precedent-setting; however, not all members

appeared convinced this was the right approach either. Mr. Colello suggested the Owner review the Historical Society's records for pictures of the house.

First Motion: On a motion by Mr. Stearns, seconded by Mr. McMahon, the application was approved to change the foundation and chimney with the brick veneer presented at the meeting including providing a mock-up. The applicant shall return to the Committee with a new proposal for the treatment of the siding, the treatment of the railings at the front stairs, and additional information on the retaining wall.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	No
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)		(Alt. 2)	

Second Motion: On a motion by Mr. McMahon, seconded by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, the application to approve the as-built conditions is denied.

Darby	Yes	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Yes	Stearns	Yes	Vande Stouwe	Yes
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)		(Alt. 2)	

Public Comment

Adoption of Meeting Minutes:

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Mr. McMahon, the minutes from the November 3, 2021 meeting were approved. On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, the minutes from the December 1, 2021 meeting were approved.

Subcommittee Reports

43 Ridgewood Avenue (changes per HPC comments): The subcommittee reviewed changes that related to eliminating some of the siding proposed to stucco to help simplify the addition at this Tudor Revival residence.

Old Business

Ordinance Changes: No further movement but HPC Consultant will be tracking progress with Erik DeLine, Director of Planning and Development.

Grant Application for CLG Funding: The HPC Consultant recommended not applying this year for funding but the HPC should discuss a viable project for next year.

New Business

None.

Executive Session

On a motion by Chair Darby, seconded by Mr. McMahon, the HPC moved into Executive Session.

On a motion by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, seconded by Ms. Moriarty, the HPC moved from Executive Session.

Adjournment

On a motion by Vice Chair Vande Stouwe, seconded by Ms. Moriarty, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Margaret M. Hickey, AIA
Consultant to Glen Ridge HPC