A SUMMARY OF THE MINUTES OF THE GLEN RIDGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HELD IN THE MUNICIPAL BUILDING

September 7, 2022

OPMA & Roll Call

Vice Chair McMahon called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. and Ms. Hickey read the Sunshine Act Notice and called the roll.

This meeting was held via a video conference.

- PRESENT: Vice Chair Dan McMahon Nicholas Colello Joaquin Stearns Christine Yewaisis Nicholas Colello George Lane (Alt. 1) Margaret M. Hickey, Consultant to the Historic Preservation Commission
- ABSENT: Chair Geoffrey Darby Peter Korian Ginny Moriarty

Hearing of the Applications

Vice Chair McMahon introduced himself and briefly described the hearing process to the applicants and the members of the public.

77 Highland Avenue

Kim and Paul Colahan

Vice Chair McMahon called for the application. Kim Colahan, Owner and her Architect, Dan Kopec, presented the application, which is a return from last month, to add an accessory building housing a garage and pool house at the corner of Highland Avenue and Mead Terrace. Mr. Kopec presented two new drawings showing the new building in context with the neighborhood and explained the changes made since the previous meeting. These include: changed garage doors from over-head doors to swing doors with more glass panels; changed casements sashes to double-hung to match those facing the street; changed the sliding doors to read like French doors; and revised deck and railings to be more traditional. The solar panels were removed but reserve to revisit this once the building is constructed, provided a detail for the new railings, and provided cut sheets for the lights.

Mr. Kopec also reviewed the building massing through the additional drawings which show the new building in relationship to the main house, which is two-and-one-half-stories, and the grade drops off at the backyard so the new building would be subordinate to the principal dwellings along Mead Terrace. Mr. McMahon noted that a concern remains about the length of the building. Mr. Stearns noted that it may not be the length of the building but the distance of the new building to the property line; it is too close to Mead Terrace. Ms. Yewaisis agreed the building is too long. Mr. Colello was fine with the massing. Mr. Stearns suggested moving the building a few feet to the south, possibly two-to-three feet so it is further from the street. Owner noted that they would prefer not to shorten the building.

Regarding the details for the addition, Mr. Stearns thought the lights may be too big and suggested Mr. Kopec check before ordering. All other HPC members agreed the changes in the details reflect the concerns expressed at the last meeting. Ms. Yewaisis remained concern about the new building's massing.

On a motion by Mr. Stearns, seconded by Mr. Colello, to approve the application with the following conditions to be reviewed by subcommittee:

1. Move the building at least three (3) feet from the property line or do a combination of cutting back the building and moving it so there is a total separation from the property line of an additional three (3) feet from Mead Terrace.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	No	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

5 Sherman Avenue Peter Stopp

Vice Chair McMahon called for the application. Peter Stopp, Owner, presented the application, which is a return from last month, to add a one-story side entrance/mud room. The owner explained the purpose of the addition was to create a mud room for safety and convenience; it would face Sherman Avenue. The changes include windows that match the main house, simplifies the openings around the entrance door, and maintains the roofline as shown previously.

Mr. Colello noted the height of the windows on the front elevation should match the existing windows at the front. Mr. Stearns questioned how the flat roof is going to match up with pent roof to be finished with slate. He noted there should be a detailing showing this transition. Mr. Stearns also agreed the window should match the main house or the heads of the windows should at least align. Recommended providing cut sheets on the windows and door.

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Mr. Stearns, to approve the application with the following conditions to be reviewed by the subcommittee:

- 1. Provide a detail for the flashing at the roof transition.
- 2. Move the window at the front up to align with top and bottom with the existing window at the main house.
- 3. Revise the drawings so they are coordinated.
- 4. Provide specifications on the proposed doors and windows; window to match existing and drawings should show the size.
- 5. Add a note that the trim is to match the existing house.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

Vice Chair McMahon recused himself from the next application.

183 Forest Avenue Carolyn Badenhausen

Ms. Yewaisis called for the application. Carolyn Badenhausen, Owner, and her Architect, Val DiGiacinto, presented the application for a new front stoop overhang. Mr. DiGiacinto explained the design: the roof will match that of the main house, the column supports will be wood-clad, and the design is meant to support the un-supported cantilever bay above. Mr. Colello and Mr. Stearns began speaking about some of the details but Ms. Yewaisis turned the conversation to speak about this proposed alteration and how it does not match the character-defining features of the existing house. Most agreed that the new porch overhang is larger than the bay projection and overwhelms the entry, which has a distinctive surround. Mr. DiGiacinto noted that the building has been changed. There was extensive conversation about the design and some suggestions from all members on how what is proposed could be modified and still in keeping with the existing architecture. No options could be developed without changes to the drawings. Ms. Yewaisis noted that she would be open to a different design but could not vote yes on what was currently being presented. The Owner withdrew the application.

Vice Chair McMahon returned to the meeting.

8 Summit Road

Zhaohua Meng and Yan Wang

Vice Chair McMahon called for the application. Zhaohua Meng and Yan Wang, Owners, presented the application to replace the existing slate roof with asphalt shingles. The roof is from 1912 and the Owners have made repairs but the slates have reached the end of their useful life and must be replaced. The owners stated that a new slate roof would cost \$200,000 and noted that the upper part of the dormer at the rear has asphalt shingles. Mr. McMahon noted that the HPC does not permit the replacement of slate roofs and that cost is not a consideration in their decision making. There was a brief consideration of possibly just approving slate on the front, which is the visible side of the roof and a different material on the rear, which is not visible but this did not take traction with the members. He noted that the Owner could appeal this decision to the planning board.

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Mr. Colello, to deny the application to change the roof to
asphalt shingles.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

281 Forest Avenue Justin Gutman

Vice Chair McMahon called for the application. Rudin Mane, the Contractor, presented the application to add a window on the yard-side of the garage and a new man door on the opposite side of the garage. The windows are to be Andersen 400 series and the new door is to match the existing door on the yard-side. The new window is to be 72" x 60". Mr. Colello thought the man door may be too close to the edge of the building. Mr. Stearns recommended the window be two grouped hung windows matching the existing windows at the rear of the garage and the masonry opening should match the detailing of masonry window openings at the main house.

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Mr. Stearns, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions to be reviewed by the subcommittee:

- 1. Change to two (2) paired double-hung windows to match the existing at the garage.
- 2. Masonry openings to match the detailing of the masonry openings at the main house.
- 3. Masonry opening to be centered between the end of roof and the existing man door.
- 4. Provide revised drawings showing the plans and elevations accurately.
- 5. Provide cut sheets for the new windows.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

73 Douglas Road

Penelope Bigelow and Neil Tiwari

Vice Chair McMahon called for the application. Penelope Bigelow, Owner, and her Architect, Val DiGiacinto, presented the application for repairs to the front porch, a rear addition and related modifications. The application was reviewed in two parts.

The first part focuses on the front porch, which is in poor condition. The balusters would be recreated with either painted wood or phypon (polyurethane). The applicant is still waiting on a sample and price for the phypon before they make a decision on whether the phypon will be employed. The work will include adding a bottom rail to help stop the rotting of the bottom of the balusters and the top rail will be raised to 34 inches. The work also includes restoring the trim, preserving the stairs, and cutting back the built-in gutter and installing a k-gutter. Mr. Stearns confirmed the stairs are to remain. Mr. Colello recommended keeping the treads in two pieces.

On a motion by Mr. Colello, seconded by Ms. Yewaisis, to approve the application as submitted with the following condition to be reviewed by subcommittee:

1. If the phypon railing is to be used; a sample will need to be reviewed.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

The second part of the application is to remove a chimney and add a rear addition. The rear addition is designed to have a smaller footprint with a combined gabled roof. The two dormers would be eliminated and one chimney at the back will be removed completely. This work includes eliminating the chimney at the front and replacing it with a false chimney. There will also be some window modifications on the side elevation. The treatment for the addition is new siding and trim to match the existing and the installation of Andersen 400 windows. Mr. Lane noted he has admired this house. Mr. Stearns confirmed the chimney at the rear is being completely eliminated and the front chimney will be reconstructed above the roofline only with thin brick. Ms. Yewaisis said the addition is nicely done and agreed with the approach to the chimneys. Mr. McMahon said the faux detailing of the chimney would need a mock-up including showing the color and size of the brick and the type of mortar to be used. Mr. Stearns noted that the front gable may be drawn incorrectly.

On a motion by Mr. Lane, seconded by Ms. Yewaisis, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions to be reviewed by subcommittee:

- 1. Provide a sample of thin brick and mortar including a mock-up in place for the false chimney.
- 2. Revise the drawings so the front gable roof height is correct.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

Mr. Colello recused himself from the next application.

42 Herman Street

Katherine Ryland and Evan Newkirk

Vice Chair McMahon called for the application. Evan Newkirk, Owner, presented the application to rehabilitate the front porch. The application keeps the foundation, railings, and design elements, but install the new railing a little higher for safety purposes. Vice Chair McMahon confirmed all of the posts will be replaced with custom turned wood posts, and the roof and cornice will be maintained. The new stair is going to be slightly wider than what it is now so it sits between the two columns. Ms. Yewaisis confirmed the material will be either mahogany or cedar, and the railings will have 2x2 balusters.

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Mr. Lane, to approve the application as submitted.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Recused	McMahon	Yes
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

Mr. Colello returned to the meeting.

Vice Chair McMahon recused himself from the next application.

209 Ridgewood Avenue

Mark and Laurie Davis

Ms. Yewaisis called for the application. Mark and Laurie Davis, Owners, and their Architect, Jason Krueser, presented the application for a new accessory structure that will be visible at the corner of Ridgewood Avenue and Snowden Place. This new building will be used as a pool house and spa and located at the rear of the property away from Snowden Place. The architect explained the design including the details to match the detailing of the Queen Anne style of the main house. Some non-matching elements include: the windows on the street side will be clerestory; the equipment will be enclosed by cypress or cedar. Mr. Colello appreciated that the building copies the features of the main house but that the front looks too heavy. He suggested the gable should be set back with a low-slope roof to help break up the massing. Mr. Stearns agreed about the attention to detail, but thought it looked too much like a dollhouse and its small size makes it appear to be too busy. He also expressed concern about the clerestory windows as the wall facing the street looks very blank and out of place with the main house. The elevation appears unbalanced and suggested changing the windows to double-hungs and located near the closet. He also suggested that the two patterns of shingles could be scaled back or simplified. Mr. Lane confirmed the building the height will be fifteen

feet to the peak. He also noted the gutters, which will be copper half-round. should be shown on the drawings. Mr. Stearns recommended flipping the doors to the sauna with those of the storage to keep the utilities on the non-visible side. The HPC members discussed these various suggestions and asked the Architect to take them into account when revising the drawings; the changes will be reviewed by subcommittee.

On a motion by Mr. Stearns, seconded by Mr. Lane, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions to be reviewed by subcommittee:

- 1. Add the gutters to the drawings.
- 2. Review the various suggestions regarding the changes to the windows and doors.

Darby	Absent	Colello	Yes	McMahon	Recused
Moriarty	Absent	Stearns	Yes	Korian	Absent
Yewaisis	Yes	Lane (Alt. 1)	Yes		

Vice Chair McMahon returned to the meeting.

Subcommittee:

94 Sunset (rear addition): Window position modifications reviewed and approved by subcommittee.

507 Ridgewood Avenue (minimally visible rear deck stair): Permit application that did not realize it needed HPC review. A small portion of stair would be visible so it was reviewed and approved at subcommittee.

22 Hamilton Street (Rear addition and new garage): Reviewed and approved stone to match house for foundation. Waiting on mortar mock-up.

Glen Ridge Library (Book Kiosk): Approved the brick sample. Waiting on mortar mock-up.

Old Business

- Ordinance Changes: In progress/will be addressed at Borough's December meeting.
- **Continuing Education:** October 5, 2022 Meeting at 6:30 pm

NEW BUSINESS

• **Replacement**: Mr. Kim left the board since last month and Ms. Hickey mentioned that members should provide suggestions for a replacement.

Adjournment

On a motion by Ms. Yewaisis, seconded by Vice Chair McMahon, with all in favor, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Margaret M. Hickey, AIA Consultant to Glen Ridge HPC